



**BEACON HILL ARCHITECTURAL DISTRICT
PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES**

Boston City Hall Boston, MA, 02201

Held virtually via Zoom

AUGUST 17, 2023

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Mark Kiefer, Arian Allen, Maurice Finegold, Edward Fleck, Annette Given, Ralph Jackson, Alice Richmond

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: Curtis Kemeny

STAFF PRESENT: Nicholas A. Armata, AICP

A full recording of the hearing is available at Boston.gov/landmarks

5:01 PM: Commissioner Kiefer called the public hearing to order. He explained that, pursuant to the Commonwealth of Massachusetts Executive Order Suspending Certain Provisions of the Open Meeting Law, that the public hearing was being conducted virtually via the online meeting platform Zoom in order to review Design Review applications. He also briefly explained how to participate in the online hearing. Members of the press Dan Murphy from Beacon Hill Times made himself known.

Following this brief introduction he called the first Design Review application.

I. DESIGN REVIEW

APP # 24.0157 BH

TIME: 5:05 PM

ADDRESS: 125 CHARLES STREET

Applicant: Cecilia Hermawan; Vico Style

Proposed Work: New Signage

PROJECT REPRESENTATIVES: Adam Knauer, was the project representative. He presented the proposed scope of work to the Commission, including the sign's size, shape, and material. In addition, Knauer detailed the process of installing the sign on the site.

DOCUMENTS PRESENTED: New proposal and vantage point photos that depict where the sign would be placed.

DISCUSSION TOPICS (BRIEF): Visibility of the sign from the street, the height, size, and material of the sign.



COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS: During the Commissioner comment and discussion period, the following topics were discussed in greater detail, including the sign's height, size, material, and position of the sign on the building. Commissioners suggested utilizing a wood sign rather than high-density urethane (HDU). To be consistent with the standards and criteria, the Commission recommended that the signage material be wood.

PUBLIC COMMENT: During the public comment period, Diana Coldren, from the Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA), opposed the proposed work based on guideline A7. The sign was too large and out of scale with the building and should be limited to the area to the left of the first-floor window or below the window lentils to avoid interfering with the upstairs neighboring business. The BHCA also suggested that the sign be wooden instead of HDU.

COMMISSIONER RICHMOND MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION WITH PROVISOS. COMMISSIONER JACKSON SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 6-1-2 (Y: AA, EF, AG, RJ, MK, AR) (N: MF) (ABSTAIN/ABSENT: CK)

- *That the sign be made with wood rather than the specified HDU.*
- *That the color of the sign be as indicated in the application and that a color chip be submitted to staff for approval.*
- *That the sign be mounted with the bottom of it, four brick courses above the granite.*

APP # 24.0135 BH

TIME: 5:35 PM

ADDRESS: 18 PHILLIPS STREET

Applicant: John Hecker; Spencer Preservation

Proposed Work: Rebuild front slab and install drains, install removable handrail, new electrical outlets under existing windows at front of plaza.

PROJECT REPRESENTATIVES: Lynne Spencer, and Doug Manley from the Spencer Preservation Group were the project representatives. They presented the proposed scope of work to the Commission, which included a presentation depicting installations and renovations to the Vilna Shul Boston Center for Jewish Culture on 18 Phillips Street.

DOCUMENTS PRESENTED: New proposal, existing condition photos, repair legend for the N.E.S.W elevations.

DISCUSSION TOPICS: Discussion included installing weatherproof outlets and temporary stairs as a safety piece for events—materials and product details for the plaza slab, drains, and steps. Discussions also included replacing the steps, slab, and drain in-kind.



COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS: During the Commissioner comment and discussion period, the following topics were discussed in greater detail: whether the proposal was reviewed within the subcommittee, the installation of new electrical and temporary railings, and the future slab's position on the vertical wall and elevations.

PUBLIC COMMENT: During the public comment period, Diana Coldren, from the Beacon Hill Civic Association, spoke in support of the proposed work. Specifically in support of the surface changes that are minimal and visual in impact. Also, in support of a temporary guardrail of appropriate appearance and location per guideline A3. They support the proposed locations of covered outlets as they are to be in places of limited visibility per guideline A9.

COMMISSIONER KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION WITH PROVISOS. COMMISSIONER FINEGOLD SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 7-0-2 (Y:AA, MF, EF, AG,RJ,MK, AR) (N: NONE)(ABSTAIN/ABSENT: CK)

- *That the electrical outlets be located as indicated in the hearing, on the back of the peers rather than in the window wells.*

APP # 23.1041 BH

TIME: 5:52 PM

ADDRESS: 68 BEACON STREET

Applicant: John Carlton

Proposed Work: Replace front door in kind.

PROJECT REPRESENTATIVES: John Carlton, was the project representative. They presented the proposed scope of work to the Commission, which included the causes of deterioration of the original door, the replication process for the proposed door, and the materials and products used for the proposed glass panels and door.

DOCUMENTS PRESENTED: Existing condition photos, architectural image showing the dimensions of the replacement door and glass panels.

DISCUSSION TOPICS (BRIEF): Discussion included the causes that led to the door's deteriorating state, the production & design process of creating a replica to replace the original doors, the safety concerns regarding old glass and lack of screw security, and the recommended wood and glass material for the replacement door.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS: During the Commissioner comment and discussion period, the following topics were discussed in greater detail: the safety hazards of old glass prone to breakage, the security issues concerning screws that cannot secure the door, and designing new doors to replicate the original door also, that the material of the original door creates a structural problem that the proposed



material would solve.

PUBLIC COMMENT: During the public comment period, Diana Coldren, from the Beacon Hill Civic Association, spoke in opposition to the proposed work. Coldren noted that when the BHCA reviewed this application, they were unaware that a specialist determined that the doors needed to be replaced. This committee comment was made prior to learning that information. They opposed this application as it needed representation from a restoration specialist who stated the historic doors were beyond repair per guideline E1. Also, it lacked shop drawings showing how the proposed work would be executed with the highest quality, material, and workmanship as guideline A6.

COMMISSIONER KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION WITH PROVISOS. COMMISSIONER ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 7-0-2 (Y: AA, MF, EF, AG,RJ,MK, AR) (N: NONE) (ABSTAIN/ABSENT: CK)

- *That the numeral be relocated to the center of the lintel above the door.*

APP # 24.0018 BH

TIME: 6:06 PM

ADDRESS: 97 MOUNT VERNON STREET

Applicant: Kristin Jenkins

Proposed Work: New sign with bracket and light fixture.

PROJECT REPRESENTATIVES: Kristen Jenkins, was the project representative. They presented the proposed scope of work to the Commission, which included drawings of the new sign, brackets, and light fixture.

DOCUMENTS PRESENTED: Existing condition photos, architectural drawings that depict the proposed signage, brackets, and dimensions.

DISCUSSION TOPICS (BRIEF): Discussion concerning the illumination, dimensions, color, and material of the new sign.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS: During the Commissioner comment and discussion period, the following topics were discussed in greater detail: illumination, and whether the applicant would like to replace the sign and bracket and repair the current broken illumination instead of installing a new sign, bracket, and light fixture.

PUBLIC COMMENT: During the public comment period, Diana Coldren, from the Beacon Hill Civic Association, spoke in support of the proposed work. However, without the illumination per guideline I.12. BHCA recommends that the new brackets be attached through mortar joints. Ron Raikula, a neighbor of the restaurant at 101 Mount Vernon, opposed the additional illumination and recommended that the sign be repositioned to the opposite side of the awning to eliminate confusion about where the restaurant



begins and where his property ends.

COMMISSIONER KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION WITH PROVISOS. COMMISSIONER FINEGOLD SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 6-1-2 (Y:AA, MF, EF, AG,RJ,MK) (N: AR) (ABSTAIN/ABSENT: CK)

- *That the bracket be installed into the mortar joints, not the brick*
- *That the illumination be denied without prejudice to give the applicant leave to explore other alternatives that would further mitigate spill of the lights onto the adjacent property, or otherwise and alternatives that would illuminate the sign from above rather than below.*

APP # 24.0106 BH

TIME: 6:46 PM

ADDRESS: 60 JOY STREET

Applicant: Kenneth Crisafulli

Proposed Work: Rebuild the community basketball court, repair, rebuild, restore, brick retaining wall, brick piers, iron fence along South Russell Street sidewalk, replace in kind existing signage, refurbish existing benches, install new basketball pole, backboard, rim.

PROJECT REPRESENTATIVES: Kenneth Crisafulli was the project representative. They presented the proposed scope of work to the Commission, which included restoring areas surrounding the basketball court, public garden, and sidewalk over Peter Faneuil House on South Russell Street.

DOCUMENTS PRESENTED: Existing condition photos.

DISCUSSION TOPICS (BRIEF): Discussion concerning the damage the basketball court has endured as a result of construction projects for the property. To rectify the damage the applicant discussed proposing restorations to the basketball court, brick walls & piers, and their iron fence.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS: During the Commissioner Comment and discussion period, the following topics were discussed in greater detail including the reinstallation and replacement of bricks that were removed from the wall.

PUBLIC COMMENT: During the public comment period, Diana Coldren, from the Beacon Hill Civic Association spoke in support of the proposed work but would request shop drawings are necessary per guideline A6. BHCA would request clarification regarding the samples of brick materials to be used. Richelle Gewertz, a resident in the area, had comments regarding the picking concrete that's missing in the portions of the piers. Gewertz located parts of the pier and sought to return the materials to the applicant.



COMMISSIONER KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION WITH THE PROVISOS. COMMISSIONER FINEGOLD SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 7-0-2 (Y: AA,MF,EF, AG,RJ,MK, AR) (N: NONE) (ABSTAIN/ABSENT: CK).

- *That shop drawings are to be submitted to staff for final approval.*

APP # 24.0108 BH

TIME: 6:54 PM

ADDRESS: 30 LIME STREET

Applicant: James Fay; Street & Company

Proposed Work: Install a hand railing on the right side wall leading up to the door between 26 and 30 Lime Street. Paint (Ben Moore HC 190).

PROJECT REPRESENTATIVES: Jim Fay, the property manager for 30 Lime St, was the project representative. They presented the proposed scope of work to the Commission, detailing their proposal to install a replacement replica of a hand railing.

DOCUMENTS PRESENTED: Existing condition photos, visibility image of the site from the street.

DISCUSSION TOPICS (BRIEF): Discussion concerning the position of the hand railing and whether the hand railing would be an exact replica of the previous railing.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS: During the Commissioner Comment and discussion period, the following topics were discussed in greater detail: the placement of the hand railing.

STAFF COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS: Shop drawings of this railing on 26 Lime St have been approved and filed in the archives.

PUBLIC COMMENT: During the public comment period, Diana Coldren, from the Beacon Hill Civic Association, spoke in support of the proposed work but requested shop drawings as per guidelines A 3 and A 6. This committee comment was made before learning that the archives had filed and approved shop drawings.

COMMISSIONER KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION WITH PROVISOS. COMMISSIONER ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 6-0-2-1 (Y: AA,MF,EF,RJ,MK, AR) (N: NONE) (ABSTAIN/ABSENT: CK) (RECUSED: AG)

- *To replicate the railing on the adjacent property 26 Lime Street and to replicate the shop drawing in the file for property 26, and that a copy of shop drawing be included within his application.*



APP # 24.0111 BH

TIME: 7:00 PM

ADDRESS: 7 LOUISBURG SQUARE

Applicant: Chad Shaffer

Proposed Work: Replace two historic 6 over 6 windows on the fourth floor with new replacement windows; 6 over 6, wood, true divided lights, double hung.

PROJECT REPRESENTATIVES: Alexander Sassaroli, the Project Architect from Stephen Harris Architects, Sherif Koyess, the Project Director from Cedar Construction, and Anthony Greenwood, an Old Bostonian Window and Door Restoration Expert, were the project representatives. They presented the proposed scope of work to the Commission, which included a proposal to remove and replace historic wood and windows on the property.

DOCUMENTS PRESENTED: Existing condition photos, letters from the Old Bostonian in support of restoring the rotting wood and windows, and architectural and structural drawings of the windows, doors, and front facade of the site.

DISCUSSION TOPICS (BRIEF): Discussion concerning replicating, replacing, and refurbishing the wood piece, as the representatives claimed the damage and rot within the wood make it not structurally sound. Additionally, whether the applicant should replace or restore the window.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS: During the Commissioner comment and discussion period, the following topics were discussed in greater detail: the location of rot and damage within the wood and whether to replace or repair the damaged wood. Commissioners also inquired about the manufacturer of the windows and whether the restoration specialist was the creator of the doors and windows.

STAFF COMMENTS: Didn't view anything in the application that couldn't be restored which led to the recommendation of denial for this application.

PUBLIC COMMENT: During the public comment period, Diana Coldren, from the Beacon Hill Civic Association, spoke in support of the proposed work, giving evidence from a restoration specialist as per guideline E1. The BHCA also noted that all other windows on this property have been approved and replaced.

COMMISSIONER FINEGOLD MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION AS PROPOSED. COMMISSIONER GIVEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 6-1-2 (Y: MF, EF, AG, RJ, MK, AR) (N: AA)(ABSTAIN/ABSENT: CK)

APP # 23.1203 BH

TIME: 7:18 PM

ADDRESS: 17 LOUISBURG SQUARE

Applicant: Derrick Tyler; Sleeping Dog Properties

Proposed Work: New Intercom inside a brass box, new door knob, locking cylinder, and rosette. (See *Additional Items Under Administrative Review*).



PROJECT REPRESENTATIVES: Joe Boccelli was the project representative. They presented the proposed scope of work to the Commission, which included removing and replacing the existing door knob, locking cylinder, and rosette—additionally, installing a new intercom system.

DOCUMENTS PRESENTED: Existing condition photos, images of the proposed front doorbell cover, intercom, brass cover plate and front facade elevation.

DISCUSSION TOPICS (BRIEF): Discussion concerning the removal and replacement of door knob, locking cylinder, and rosette.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS: During the Commissioner comment and discussion period, the following topics were discussed in greater detail, including the proposed intercom system and the existing wiring for the intercom system.

PUBLIC COMMENT: During the public comment period, Diana Coldren, from the Beacon Hill Civic Association, spoke in support of the proposed work as the replacement hardware is a traditional design similar to the original satisfying guideline, E5, also because the new intercom in the same location as the old will utilize a brass cover, satisfying guideline E7.

COMMISSIONER FINEGOLD MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION WITH PROVISOS. COMMISSIONER JACKSON SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 7-0-2 (Y: AA, MF, EF, AG, RJ, MK, AR) (N: NONE) (ABSTAIN/ABSENT: CK)

- *That the applicant makes their changes as narrow as possible to maximize the reveal of brownstone.*

TIME: 7:30 PM The Chair announced that the Commission would next review administrative review/approval applications.

II. ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW/ APPROVAL

APP # 24.0114 BH 31-33 CHARLES STREET (63 CHESTNUT): Replace old vent grate at ground level on wall of 31-33 Charles Street. Replace five pressure treated planks on sidewalk in front of 63 Charles Street in kind (no finish).

APP # 24.0050 BH 103 CHARLES STREET: Replace three non-historic, 1 over 1 sash sets on the front elevation, third floor. Replacements will be wood, double hung sash sets. The new sash will be using clear glass, solid block construction, oil based glazed & painted semi-gloss black st the exterior to match the exterior of all the windows on the building. Remove the existing broken non-functional aluminum storm windows. All wood sills, jambs, brick moldings will remain. No masonry will be altered.



APP # 24.0048 BH 97 CHESTNUT STREET: Paint existing front door and garage door to match existing paint color. Paint color is Benjamin Moore Soft Gloss Gray mix to match existing color.

APP # 24.0129 BH 38 HANCOCK STREET: Repair and repaint fire escapes in kind.

APP # 23.1203 BH 17 LOUISBURG SQUARE: New EV charging port as approved at #6 Louisburg Sq. (See Additional Items Under Design Review).

APP # 24.0005 BH 8 OTIS PLACE: Fabricate and install new copper edge metal, the same size and profile as the existing copper edge metal. Existing copper gutters to remain.

APP # 24.0043 BH 75 MOUNT VERNON STREET: At front facade, cut 3/4" into the joints of the bricks and repoint. Mortar to match the existing historic tooling, profile color and texture. Refinish lintels and sills as needed in kind.

APP # 24.0124 BH 3 MYRTLE STREET: At front front façade: cut 3/4" into the joints of the bricks and repoint. Refinish lintels and sills in kind and paint to match the existing. Spot repoint rear facade in kind.

APP # 23.0135 BH 18 PHILLIPS STREET: The existing ornamental wrought iron fence and central entry gates will be removed, restored, and repainted with a durable marine paint system, and reinstalled. The gates to the east and west alleys will be treated in a similar manner. The six (6) existing precast concrete piers will be repaired by filling surface cracks and patching missing areas of cast stone. Pier 'A' will be disassembled and reinstalled on a new cast-in-place concrete footing and foundation. The two pairs of existing wood entry doors will be removed and restored as part of the plaza restoration. New in-kind door hardware will be provided wherever the existing hardware cannot be reused. The two precast concrete jambs that flank the main entry doorways support the large arch above. Both jamb sections exhibit vertical stress cracks due to excessive loading. These two jamb sections will be replaced with new, in-kind precast concrete sections that will be internally reinforced with stainless steel rebars. The new precast materials will match those used elsewhere at the deck Waterproof duplex outlets will be installed at the rear faces of Piers "C" and "D." (See Additional Items Under Design Review).

APP # 24.0049 BH 38 WEST CEDAR STREET: At top floor, replace four, 2 over 2 sash sets. Two window openings are on Pinckney Street & two window openings are on West Cedar Street. The existing wood sills, frames & brick molding at the exterior are to remain. The new proposed sash sets will be wood, solid block, mortise & tenon fabrication, using clear glass, true divided light and be the same pane configuration which is 2 over 2. The new wood sash would be double hung, oil based glazed at the exterior and painted "Napery" semi-gloss top match the existing exterior color on the building. The muntins would match a more original 3/4" interior profile & width, 3/16" exterior wood stem & glazing.

COMMISSIONER KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW ITEMS ON MASS. COMMISSIONER FINEGOLD SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 7-0-2 (Y: AA, MF, EF, AG, RJ, MK, AR) (N: NONE) (ABSTAIN/ABSENT: CK)



IV. RATIFICATION OF HEARING MINUTES

COMMISSIONER KIEFER MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE JULY 2023 PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES. COMMISSIONER FINEGOLD SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 7-0-2 (Y: AA, MF, EF, AG, RJ, MK, AR) (N: NONE) (ABSTAIN/ABSENT: CK)

III. STAFF UPDATES

STAFF COMMENTS:

- Seeking new commissioner (BSA) nominee.
- A demonstration on how to report and search violations.

IV. ADJOURN – 8:37 PM

COMMISSIONER KIEFER MOTIONED TO ADJOURN THE HEARING. COMMISSIONER ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 7-0-2 (Y: AA, MF, EF, AG, RJ, MK, AR) (N: NONE) (ABSTAIN/ABSENT: CK)