



**BEACON HILL ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION
PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES**

Boston City Hall, Piemonte Room
Boston, MA, 02201

NOVEMBER 18, 2021

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: *Arian Allen, Annette Given, Alice Richmond, Martha McNamara*

STAFF PRESENT: *Nicholas Armata, Senior Preservation Planner*

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: *Wen Wen*

A full recording of the hearing is available at:

<https://www.boston.gov/historic-district/beacon-hill-architectural-district>

5:00 PM:

Chair M. McNamara called the public hearing to order. She explained that, pursuant to the Commonwealth of Massachusetts Executive Order Suspending Certain Provisions of the Open Meeting Law, that the public hearing was being conducted virtually via the online meeting platform Zoom in order to review Design Review applications. She also briefly explained how to participate in the online hearing.

I. VIOLATION

VIO # 21.068 BH 29 PINCKNEY STREET

Applicant: Alex Ehrlich

Proposed Work: Ratification of unapproved window replacement.

The applicant failed to appear.



APP # 22.0469 BH 82 REVERE STREET

Applicant: Jennifer Garran

Proposed Work: Repaint front door navy blue 1798.

Project Representative: Jennifer Garran

Documents Presented: Existing conditions photos, paint color

Discussion Topics: Why the door was repainted, the color, the finish, how to resolve the issue related to the finish as seen from the street.

Public Comment: From the Beacon Hill Civic Association; after getting direction from commissioners for the violation we feel this application is incomplete. The color number is missing manufacturer, name and finish. The color is a blue and we can support this application if the applicant has sufficient information ready at the hearing.

COMMISSIONER MCNAMARA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION W. PROVISOS, A.ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4-0-0 (Y: AA, AG, AR, and MM).

- That the new finish is a matt or semi-gloss.
- That a sample mock-up will be set up and approved by staff.

APP # 22.0516 BH 35 PINCKNEY STREET.

Applicant: Arthur Choo

Proposed Work: Replace existing roof deck.

Project Representative: Shane Losi, Architect

Documents Presented: Existing conditions photos, shop drawings, visibility studies

Discussion Topics: Previous approval, visibility, materials of deck rail, height.

Public Comment: The Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) stated that the deck is too visible and should not be approved. Meghan Awe, a neighbor, had concerns about privacy.

COMMISSIONER RICHMOND MOTIONED TO CONTINUE THE APPLICATION, COMMISSIONER MCNAMARA SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4-0-0 (Y: AA, AG, AR, and MM).



APP # 22.0540 BH 11 IRVING STREET

Applicant: Christine Connolly

Proposed Work: Install security gate at garden level entry.

Project Representative: Christine Connolly

Documents Presented: Existing conditions photos, shop drawings of gate,

Discussion Topics: Previous approval, visibility, materials of deck rail, height.

Public Comment: The Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) stated that the gate was put up without the approval of the Commission, and should be reinstalled following the guidelines of the district. Donna Lemming, A condominium owner at the property also supported the gate.

COMMISSIONER RICHMOND MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION AS SUBMITTED, COMMISSIONER ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 3-0-1 (Y: AA, AG, AR) (N: MM).

APP # 22.0540 BH 77 CHESTNUT STREET

Applicant: Eduardo Serrate

Proposed Work: Repaint windows and garage door from existing green to black, repaint currently painted masonry wall at roof deck, repaint entry door green to match existing, repaint covered entry paneling from existing beige to green to match entry door, replace entry door hardware, accessories, light fixture, and doorbell station.

Project Representative: Eduardo Serrate

Documents Presented: Existing conditions photos, shop drawings, Renderings, mfg cut sheets.

Discussion Topics: appropriate color for this architecture, age of light being replaced, hardware appropriateness.

Public Comment: The Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) stated that they find the proposed mail slot acceptable. Proposed door handle, entry light and the numbers are too contemporary for the historic district. We ask that the doorbell/ intercom panel be smaller for a single family residence. We recommend keeping the windows the existing color and paint the garage door to match the windows.

COMMISSIONER MCNAMARA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION W. PROVISOS, COMMISSIONER ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 3-1-0 (Y: AA, AG, AR, and MM).

- That the door surround will be painted a cream color and that the applicant returns with a more appropriate light and hardware.



APP # 22.0551 BH 10 WALNUT STREET

Applicant: Tim Burke

Proposed Work: Remove deteriorated bluestone sidewalk panels, install new granite curb and bluestone sidewalk panels, install granite step at service entry. Install three bollards.

Project Representative: Tim Burke

Documents Presented: Existing conditions photos, shop drawings, Renderings, mfg. cut sheets.

Discussion Topics: History of paving surfaces, bollard appropriateness, step to service door,

Public Comment: The Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) stated that they support new bluestone even if it is a veneer on cement to strengthen and allow for using less thick bluestone. Apparently it is hard to source thick cut bluestone these days. The bollards and the granite step that would go on the sidewalk are questions for the City of Boston and not under the purview of the Commission. If bollards get approved we defer to Commission for a simple design that is seen at certain locations throughout the historic district. The curb on either side is not the same dimension. It would be hard to get a granite curb in without taking all panels up.

COMMISSIONER MCNAMARA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION W. PROVISOS, COMMISSIONER ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4-1-0 (Y: AA, AG, AR, and MM).

- Bollards are not approved, coal chute must be maintained.
- That the step is mocked up for commission review.



APP # 22.0552 BH 59 BEACON STREET

Applicant: Carl Solander

Proposed Work: New handrail.

Project Representative: Carl Solander

Documents Presented: Existing conditions photos, shop drawings.

Discussion Topics: Area examples, precedent, attachment points for real, style of rail.

Public Comment: The Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) stated that they support this application and recommend a simple two post flat handrail that gets attached to the facade in the mortar of the brick and with minimal penetrations in the steps. The examples given are more relevant to the federal style homes in the area.

The spot on the step submitted as evidence of a previous handrail was most likely a boot scraper post.

COMMISSIONER MCNAMARA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION W. PROVISOS, COMMISSIONER GIVEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4-0-0 (Y: AA, AG, AR, and MM).

- That the rail will be a simple metal rail
- That the rail will only have the minimum amount of contact points with the façade and steps. Details are to be remanded to staff for final approval.

APP # 22.00543 BH 10 OTIS PLACE

Applicant: Jim Fay; Street & Company

Proposed Work: Re-clad head house in standing seam aluminum panels.

Project Representative: Jim Fay

Documents Presented: Existing conditions photos,

Discussion Topics: Visibility, mock ups, choice of materials.

Public Comment: The Beacon Hill Civic Association (BHCA) did not support the application due to a lack of information.

COMMISSIONER MCNAMARA MOTIONED TO CONTINUE THE APPLICATION W. PROVISOS, COMMISSIONER ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 3-0-1 (Y: AA, AR, and MM) (AB: AG).



II. ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW/APPROVAL: *In order to expedite the review process, the commission has delegated the approval of certain work items, such as those involving ordinary maintenance and repair, restoration or replacement, or which otherwise have a minimal impact on a building's appearance, to commission staff pending ratification at its monthly public hearing. **Having been identified as meeting these eligibility criteria and all applicable guidelines, the following applications will be approved at this hearing:***

► Applicants whose projects are listed under this heading **NEED NOT APPEAR** at the hearing. Following the hearing, you will be issued a Determination Sheet to present at the Inspectional Services Department (1010 Massachusetts Avenue) as proof of project approval when applying for permits. ISD personnel will send an electronic copy of your building-permit application to the commission staff for review. (To avoid potential confusion, the text of your building-permit application should be consistent with the project description given below.) Commission staff will accordingly authorize the execution of the work, attaching any applicable provisos, reflecting the relevant guidelines and precedents.

► **PLEASE NOTE THAT FOLLOWING ISSUANCE OF THE DETERMINATION SHEET NO FURTHER CORRESPONDENCE WILL BE ISSUED FOR THE APPLICATIONS LISTED BELOW.** The electronic building-permit application as annotated by commission staff will constitute your Certificate of Appropriateness; this will be valid for two years from the date of the approval letter. The applicant is required to notify the commission of any project changes; failure to do so may affect the status of the approval.

► If you have any questions not addressed by the above information, please contact staff at 617.635.3850 or BeaconHillAC@boston.gov Thank you.

APP # 22.0519 BH 29 BRIMMER STREET: At front and rear facades, level three, replace five, 2 over 2, wood windows with five, 2 over 2, wood windows.

APP # 22.0436 BH 28 GARDEN STREET: Fabricate and install new shutters, restore shutter dogs and replace those that are missing with same style as originals.

APP # 22.0425 BH 52 GARDEN STREET: Restore and refinish the front door and surround in kind.

APP # 22.0536 BH 10 HANCOCK STREET: Restore and repaint existing historic windows at front façade, level two.

APP # 22.0349 BH 47 JOY STREET: At front and side facades, all floors, replace all, 1 over 1, wood, double hung windows with 1 over 1, wood, double hung windows.

APP # 22.0468 BH 60 JOY STREET: Repair catch basin on athletic court.



APP # 22.0490 BH 60 JOY STREET: Spot repointing and brick replacement; bricks to match existing in color.

APP # 22.0351 BH 5 MYRTLE STREET: At front and side facades, all floors, replace all 1 over 1, wood, double hung windows with 1 over 1, wood, double hung windows.

APP # 22.0538 BH 63 PINCKNEY STREET: Repaint front steps and doors to match existing colors; Navajo White and Essex Green.

APP # 22.0459 BH 9 TEMPLE STREET #2: Replace rotting wood above windows in unit in kind.

APP # 22.0541 BH 13 WEST CEDAR STREET: Repaint front door BM Hale Navy.

COMMISSIONER MCNAMARA MOTIONED TO APPROVE, 28 GARDEN STREET APP # 22.0436 BH. APPLICATION WITH THE PROVISOS THAT THE UPPER LEVEL SHUTTERS ARE APPROVED ONLY IF THERE IS EVIDENCE THAT SHUTTERS EXISTED ON THE UPPER FLOORS (SUBMITTED TO STAFF), COMMISSIONER ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4-0-0 (Y: AA, AG, AR, AND MM).

COMMISSIONER MCNAMARA MOTIONED TO APPROVE THE REMAINING APPLICATIONS, COMMISSIONER ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4-0-0 (Y: AA, AG, AR, and MM).

III. RATIFICATION OF 10/21/2021 PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES

NO VOTE WAS TAKEN, MINUTES WERE NOT PREPARED IN TIME FOR THE HEARING

V. STAFF UPDATES

VI. ADJOURNMENT: 8:10 PM

COMMISSIONER GIVEN MOTIONED TO ADJOURN THE HEARING, COMMISSIONER ALLEN SECONDED THE MOTION. THE VOTE WAS 4-0-0 (Y: AA, AG, AR, and MM).

DATE ORIGINALLY POSTED: 6/7/2021

BEACON HILL ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

*Members: Arian Allen, Martha McNamara, Vacancy, Vacancy, Vacancy
Alternates: Vacancy, Alice Richmond, Wen Wen, Vacancy, Vacancy*